Diaspora, Maladjustment, and Hybridity in American and Pakistani Novels: A Comparative Study of Nafisa Haji and Bina Shah

Bibi Nadia[1], Ole Doering[2]

[1]Hunan Normal University, China. E-mail: bibin8402@gmail.com
[2]Hunan Normal University, China. E-mail: oledoering@googlemail.com

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
	The Pakistani diaspora in the United States confronts a range of challenges arising from the interplay of ethnicity, nationality, and religious identity. Central to these challenges is the task of reconciling deeply held religious beliefs with the prevailing norms and practices of American society. This study investigates the complexities of integrating religious faith into a culturally hybrid identity through the lens of Homi Bhabha's theory of cultural hybridity. By analysing the novels Writing on the Forehead by Nafisa Haji and Where to Dream in a Blue Moon by Bina Shah, this research explores the dynamics of cultural convergence and its implications for diasporic communities. These works offer insights into how Pakistani immigrants navigate the tension between maintaining religious fidelity and adapting to new cultural contexts. The study reveals that while the process of hybridization presents significant challenges, it also offers opportunities for enriching religious experiences and fostering intercultural dialogue. The findings underscore the importance of understanding the nuanced interplay between traditional religious practices and the evolving cultural landscape of the diaspora. This research contributes to broader discussions on multiculturalism, religious pluralism, and social cohesion, highlighting the role of literature in depicting and addressing these complex issues. Future studies should further explore how hybrid identities develop over time and the impact of generational shifts within diasporic communities on religious and cultural integration.

1. Introduction

The term "diaspora", originating from the Greek "*dia speiro*" (meaning dispersal), was first used by the historian Thucydides to describe the spread of Greek people. It refers to the movement of people with shared cultural values from their ancestral homelands to new locations (Tabassum, 2021). The Pakistani diaspora in the United States is a diverse and dynamic community that has significantly influenced various aspects of American society (Reed, 2011). This diaspora includes individuals from varied backgrounds, professions, and regions within Pakistan, forming a notable socio-cultural and economic presence in the U.S.

Pakistani Americans, engaged in fields such as medicine, technology, academia, and entrepreneurship, along with artists, activists, and community leaders, have enriched the American cultural mosaic and contributed to its economic vitality. This community acts as a bridge between the United States and Pakistan, facilitating exchanges in trade, education, and diplomacy, while also adding to the multicultural fabric through their customs, cuisine, and artistic expressions(Philippon, 2021). Despite facing challenges like discrimination and pressures to assimilate, Pakistani Americans maintain a strong sense of identity and community, embracing their roles as global citizens in an interconnected world (Werbner, 1996).

The increasing trend of migration, driven by factors such as education, employment opportunities, and escape from conflict or natural disasters, poses acculturation challenges for migrants in host countries (Tabassum, 2021). These challenges are vividly depicted in literary works like Bina Shah's "Where to Dream in a Blue Moon" and Nafisa Haji's "Writing on the Forehead," which explore the complexities of diasporic life. For instance, Pakistani immigrants in the U.S. navigate the tension between preserving their cultural identity and adapting to American society (Mintz & Coontz, 1993). This process involves internal and external challenges, including language barriers, religious differences, and societal stereotypes, which complicate integration efforts. The generational divide further adds complexity, as younger Pakistani Americans balance their heritage with their American upbringing (Zaman, 2018).

In Bina Shah's novels "Writing on the Forehead" and "Where to Dream in a Blue Moon", cultural conflicts are a significant theme, particularly the struggle between tradition and modernity. The characters grapple with societal expectations while striving for individuality. For example, in "Writing on the Forehead," the protagonist Saira faces the rigid patriarchal norms of Pakistani society as they navigate their identity as a transgender individual (Stewart, 2012). In "Where to Dream in a Blue Moon," Asfer Karim struggles with her desires for independence within the constraints of familial and societal expectations (Werbner, 1985).

Homi Bhabha's theory of cultural hybridity provides a framework for understanding these cultural conflicts, suggesting that cultures are not fixed but constantly evolving through interactions (Jones, 2022; Kraidy, 2009a; Werbner, 2021). This theory highlights the potential for creating hybrid identities and practices, encouraging dialogue and mutual respect. However, within the Pakistani community, deeply ingrained conservatism and strict adherence to cultural norms can present significant challenges to cultural integration, particularly regarding religious beliefs(Kraidy, 2002). While cultural hybridity implies the blending of elements from different cultures, the steadfast nature of religious faith often resists amalgamation, preserving traditional values amid globalization and multiculturalism (Harbord, 2006).

This study is crucial for understanding the nuanced experiences of the Pakistani diaspora in the United States, particularly through the lens of literature. By analyzing the works of Nafisa Haji and Bina Shah, this research highlights the unique challenges and opportunities faced by diasporic communities, offering insights into the broader themes of cultural identity, integration, and resilience (Twine et al., 2000). It also contributes to the discourse on cultural hybridity, providing a deeper understanding of how immigrant communities navigate the complex interplay between preserving their heritage and adapting to new cultural

environments (Boyarin & Burrus, 2005; Dweik, 2022; Jaffe et al., 1999). This study not only enriches the field of diaspora and cultural studies but also fosters greater empathy and awareness in an increasingly globalized world, encouraging more inclusive and supportive policies and practices.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Introduction to Diasporic Literature

Diasporic literature has emerged as a significant thread within the literary canon, intersecting with disciplines like history, social sciences, gender studies, and cultural studies. This genre often addresses conflicts between different cultures, settlement issues, and human and women's rights, highlighting themes such as pluralism, sustained self-identities, and respect for all people. The dynamic nature of culture—constantly evolving and assimilating new values and practices—is a recurring theme in this literature. Scholars like Mack Dowell and Sharp argue that cultures are fluid and irregular social structures that undergo continuous change, reshaping identities over time (McDowell & Sharp, 2016). Liz Bondi emphasizes the explicit connection between identity and place, suggesting that cultural elements are not fixed but are shaped by changing environments and practices (Bondi, 1999, 2014).

2.2. Cultural Hybridity and Identity

The concept of cultural hybridity is central to understanding the assimilation and blending of cultural practices. As communities migrate in search of better opportunities, they adopt new practices from their host lands while retaining aspects of their heritage. This ongoing process of cultural assimilation and adaptation is fundamental to the development of global cultures. The idea that culture can neither be completely abandoned nor wholly adopted underlines the necessity of mutual understanding and tolerance. French anthropologist Jean-Loup Amselle's work supports the notion that cultural boundaries are not rigid, but rather, culture is a continuous process (Dyck, 2007; Nursten, 2013). The complex nature of cultural hybridity, including its ambivalent and sometimes conflicting meanings, is highlighted in the works of various researchers, emphasizing that it is an inherent aspect of all cultures (Kraidy, 2002, 2009b).

2.3. Religious Identity and Hybridity

Religion is often the most resistant aspect of culture to hybridization. While cultural practices can blend and evolve, religious beliefs tend to remain steadfast. Imene Ajala notes that Muslim youth often navigate hybrid identities, particularly in their dress and self-expression, without compromising their core religious values. This contrasts with some Western societies where religious practices have blended, creating new, hybrid forms of spirituality (Almaneea, 2022; Ann Humes, 2010). The persistence of strong religious identity among Muslims, particularly in maintaining faith practices, underscores the challenges of religious hybridization in diasporic contexts (Seligman et al., 2001). While some scholars suggest that there is potential for religious diffusion at certain levels, others highlight the difficulties, particularly within the Islamic faith, which maintains strict adherence to traditional practices and beliefs (R. M. M. Al Areqi, 2016, 2022; R. Al Areqi, 2017).

2.4. Challenges in Cultural and Religious Integration

Pakistani immigrants in the United States often face significant challenges in preserving their cultural and religious identities. The fear of losing national and cultural identity amidst a backdrop of increasing transnationalism and multiculturalism is a common concern. This is particularly evident in the context of the growing need to balance traditional practices with the demands of a globalized world (R. M. M. Al Areqi, 2018; Al-Areqi et al., 2023; R. M. M. Al Areqi & Bahji, 2014). Issues such as racism, discrimination, and the stereotyping of immigrant students further complicate integration, as noted by Aneela Amir (Ajala, 2017). The Islamic perspective on cultural hybridization, especially regarding religious practices and identities, often resists integration with other cultural elements, reflecting a broader reluctance to embrace intentional hybridity (Werbner, 2013, 2023; Werbner & Werbner, 2021).

2.5. Comparative Perspectives on Cultural Practices

Comparative studies highlight the differences in cultural practices between Pakistani and American societies. In Pakistan, societal norms are deeply rooted in Islam, which shapes daily life, gender roles, and family structures (de la Torre, 2021; Mehta & Bondi, 1999). In contrast, American society is characterized by religious diversity, individualism, and a strong emphasis on personal freedom and equality (Cupito, 2002; Werbner & Werbner, 2020). These cultural differences create a complex landscape for Pakistani immigrants, who must navigate between maintaining their cultural and religious identities and integrating into American society.

2.6. The Importance of Understanding Hybridity

Understanding cultural and religious hybridity is crucial for fostering tolerance and integration in increasingly diverse societies. The sensitivity of religious elements to hybridization, as explored in various studies, highlights the challenges and opportunities for creating more inclusive communities (Spurles & Werbner, 2006; Werbner, 2000b). The literature underscores the need for continued exploration of these themes, particularly in the context of diasporic experiences, to better understand the complexities of identity, culture, and religion in a globalized world (Hooks, 2014).

3. Research Methodology

3.1. Research Design

This study employs a qualitative research design to explore the complexities of cultural hybridity and religious identity within the Pakistani diaspora in the United States. By analyzing literary works by Nafisa Haji and Bina Shah, the research seeks to understand how these authors depict the experiences of Pakistani immigrants, focusing on the challenges and adaptations associated with cultural and religious integration.

3.2. Data Collection

3.2.1 Primary Sources

The primary data for this research comprises two novels: "Writing on the Forehead" by Nafisa Haji and "Where to Dream in a Blue" by Bina Shah. These texts were selected for their thematic relevance and representation of diasporic experiences, particularly in terms of cultural conflict, identity negotiation, and religious adherence (Cohen et al., 2007).

3.2.2. Secondary Sources

Secondary data includes scholarly articles, critical essays, and existing literature on diasporic studies, cultural hybridity, and religious identity. This body of literature provides a theoretical framework and contextual background, supporting the analysis of the primary texts.

3.3. Data Analysis

The analysis was conducted using a thematic approach, focusing on identifying and interpreting key themes related to cultural hybridity, religious identity, and the immigrant experience (Creswell & Poth, 2016). This involved close reading and coding of the texts to extract relevant themes, followed by comparative analysis to identify commonalities and differences in the representation of these themes.

3.3.1. Thematic Coding

The thematic coding process included:

- Identification of Key Themes: Themes such as cultural conflict, identity negotiation, and religious adherence were identified based on initial readings of the texts and existing literature.

- Textual Analysis: The novels were analyzed for textual evidence supporting these themes, including character actions, dialogues, and narrative descriptions.

- Comparative Analysis: Comparisons were made between the two novels to explore how different authors portray similar experiences, highlighting any divergent perspectives or unique insights.

3.4. Theoretical Framework

Homi Bhabha's theory of cultural hybridity serves as the primary theoretical framework for this study. This theory provides a lens through which the fluid and evolving nature of cultural identities can be examined, particularly in the context of diasporic communities. Additionally, insights from postcolonial theory and cultural studies inform the analysis, offering a broader context for understanding the interplay between culture, identity, and power.

3.5. Ethical Considerations

Given that the research is primarily text-based, ethical considerations are minimal. However, the study ensures respectful and accurate representation of cultural and religious themes, avoiding any potential misinterpretation or bias. All secondary sources are properly cited to acknowledge original contributions and maintain academic integrity.

3.6. Limitations

The study's scope is limited to the selected literary works and may not fully encompass the diverse experiences of the Pakistani diaspora. The focus on English-language texts also limits the representation of diasporic literature to those works accessible to an English-speaking audience. Additionally, the thematic approach may not capture the full complexity of the novels, which could benefit from a broader methodological framework.

4. Findings and Discussion

4.1. Challenges in Hybridization

One of the primary challenges in hybridization lies in the doctrinal rigidity and deeply ingrained practices that define Pakistani religious identity. Predominantly Islamic, Pakistani religious traditions often maintain specific theological boundaries and cultural practices that may contrast sharply with those of other religions (Werbner, 1999a, 2000a, 2018). This divergence can foster resistance to hybridization, as there is a prevalent concern among adherents about the potential dilution or erosion of their religious identity and core values. Historical experiences, socio-political factors, and the global context of Islamophobia further exacerbate this cautious approach towards religious integration, particularly when interacting with religions that possess different theological foundations (Dawar et al., 2021).

The generational divide within the Pakistani-American community adds another layer of complexity (Atik, 2015; Mitchell, 2006). Older generations may adhere more strictly to traditional practices, while younger generations, who grow up in a multicultural American context, might adopt more flexible or syncretic approaches. This internal community dynamic reflects broader societal debates on maintaining religious purity versus embracing cultural pluralism (Allen et al., 2017; Negrão, 2008).

Another significant challenge is the internal diversity within the Pakistani diaspora itself. The community is not monolithic; it includes various sects, such as Sunni, Shia, and Ahmadi Muslims, each with its unique interpretations and practices (Leigh & Coontz, 1994; Pieterse, 1994). This intra-community diversity can complicate efforts to present a unified front in interfaith dialogues or cultural exchanges, as different subgroups may prioritize different aspects of their religious identity (Bondi, 1992).

4.2. Opportunities for Interfaith Dialogue

Despite these challenges, the American sociocultural landscape offers a unique opportunity for interfaith dialogue and cultural exchange. The United States, with its constitutional commitment to religious freedom and its diverse religious population, provides a fertile environment for exploring commonalities among different faiths (Alexandra Pitacho et al., 2019; Kukathas, 2001; Seligman et al., 2001). For Pakistani immigrants and their descendants, engaging in interfaith dialogues with practitioners of Christianity, Judaism, Buddhism, and Hinduism can lead to a deeper understanding of other religious traditions and a reevaluation of their own beliefs and practices (Esack et al., 2023; Werbner, 2010).

Such dialogues can be instrumental in dispelling misconceptions, reducing prejudice, and fostering a culture of mutual respect. They also provide a platform for Pakistani-Americans to share their religious perspectives, thereby enriching the broader discourse on faith in the United States (Werbner, 1998, 1999c).

Moreover, these dialogues often reveal shared values such as compassion, community service, and the importance of family, which can serve as common ground for building relationships (Werbner, 1999b). These shared values can become focal points around which communities can unite, despite theological differences, and work towards common societal goals, such as social justice, poverty alleviation, and environmental sustainability (Marwan and Kraidy, 2017; Hyams, 2003; Werbner, 1997).

4.3. Mechanisms for Hybridization

Effective hybridization requires thoughtful and respectful mechanisms to facilitate interaction and mutual understanding among diverse religious communities. Kraidy (2009a) proposed several key initiatives that can aid this process:

- Interfaith Dialogue Programs: These programs create structured environments where individuals from different religious backgrounds can engage in open and respectful discussions about their beliefs, practices, and values. Such dialogues are crucial for breaking down stereotypes and building trust.

- Cultural Exchange Initiatives: Festivals, joint community service projects, and educational workshops offer practical opportunities for different religious groups to collaborate. These activities not only highlight shared values but also celebrate diversity, fostering a sense of community and shared humanity.

- Educational Endeavors: Integrating comparative religion studies into educational curricula can play a significant role in fostering an inclusive mindset among younger generations. This educational approach encourages students to appreciate the richness of diverse religious traditions and prepares them to engage constructively in a pluralistic society.

- Media representation plays a crucial role in shaping perceptions and attitudes towards different religious communities. Positive portrayals of Pakistani Muslims and other minority religions in American media can help counter stereotypes and promote a more nuanced understanding of these groups. Media outlets and social media platforms can be used to share stories of interfaith cooperation and cultural hybridity, highlighting successful examples of communities working together.

4.4. Impact on Pakistani Religious Identity

The process of hybridization, when conducted with sensitivity and respect, has the potential to enrich the religious experiences of Pakistani communities in America. It allows for the preservation of fundamental religious values while also embracing the cultural diversity of the American religious landscape. This integration can lead to a more nuanced and enriched expression of Pakistani religious identity, one that acknowledges and incorporates the diversity of experiences and practices found in a multicultural context (Lindisfarne et al., 2002).

The hybridization of Pakistani religious culture in America does not necessarily mean the erosion of traditional practices. Instead, it can result in a dynamic interplay where core religious beliefs are retained, but their expression evolves in response to new cultural contexts. This adaptation can foster a sense of belonging and participation in the broader American societal framework, contributing to a more harmonious coexistence (Miller, 2012).

Moreover, the Pakistani-American experience of religious hybridization offers valuable insights into the broader dynamics of cultural integration and identity negotiation in a globalized world. As these communities navigate the complexities of maintaining their religious identity in a pluralistic society, they contribute to the ongoing dialogue about the nature of cultural and religious identity in contemporary settings (Sumai et al., 2017).

The journey toward a more inclusive and hybrid religious culture in America is a complex yet enriching process. It requires a delicate balance between preserving the essence of diverse religious identities and embracing the opportunities for dialogue and integration. As Pakistani religious culture continues to evolve in this context, it not only enriches the lives of individuals within these communities but also adds to the diverse mosaic of American religious and cultural life, promoting a spirit of unity in diversity (Werbner, 1999a).

The findings of this study suggest several avenues for future research and community initiatives. Further exploration into the lived experiences of younger generations of Pakistani-Americans could provide deeper insights into how hybrid identities are negotiated and maintained over time. Additionally, studying the role of digital spaces and social media in facilitating interfaith dialogue and cultural exchange could uncover new methods of fostering community engagement (Zaman, 2018).

Community leaders and policymakers should consider these findings when designing programs aimed at promoting cultural integration and religious tolerance. By supporting interfaith initiatives and educational programs, they can help build a more inclusive society where diversity is celebrated, and hybrid identities are recognized as a valuable aspect of the cultural landscape (Amselle, 2010; Bonnet, 2003; Heise, 2014).

Overall, the hybridization of religious and cultural identities among Pakistani-Americans is an evolving phenomenon that reflects broader trends in globalization and cultural exchange. It offers a unique lens through which to examine the complexities of identity, belonging, and community in a diverse and interconnected world (Davidson & Bondi, 2004; Helbrecht, 2011; Werbner, 2006).

5. Conclusion and Implication

This study contributes significantly to our understanding of the integration of religious faith practices within the context of American culture, particularly as experienced by the Pakistani diaspora. By exploring the dynamics of cultural convergence among Pakistani Americans, this research highlights the complex interplay between religious identity and cultural adaptation. It underscores the importance of acknowledging the multifaceted nature of identity formation within diasporic communities and offers insights into how religious practices can be both preserved and adapted in a multicultural environment.

The findings reveal that while Pakistani Americans face considerable challenges in reconciling their religious practices with American cultural norms, there are also substantial opportunities for enriching their religious experiences through hybridization. The tension between maintaining religious purity and engaging with diverse cultural practices creates a nuanced landscape where hybrid identities can emerge. This process involves navigating doctrinal rigidity and socio-cultural norms while embracing the pluralistic and inclusive environment of America.

One of the critical implications of this study is the need for a more nuanced understanding of the interplay between tribal customs and religious practices. The perceived incompatibility between Islamic teachings and certain cultural practices highlights the necessity for comprehensive research that distinguishes between these elements. Future studies should focus on clarifying these distinctions and exploring how religious and cultural identities can coexist harmoniously without compromising core beliefs.

Additionally, the study emphasizes the importance of fostering interfaith dialogue, cultural exchange, and educational initiatives to bridge gaps between different religious communities. Such efforts can promote mutual respect and understanding, paving the way for a more inclusive and harmonious society. By facilitating these interactions, Pakistani Americans and their counterparts from other faiths can collaborate to address common challenges and celebrate shared values.

Future research should investigate the long-term effects of cultural hybridization on religious identity, examining how ongoing interactions between diverse religious traditions shape and redefine individual and collective practices. It would be valuable to explore the experiences of younger generations within diasporic communities, who may approach cultural and religious integration differently from their predecessors. This could provide insights into the evolving nature of religious identity in a globalized world.

This study contributes to the broader discourse on multiculturalism, religious pluralism, and social cohesion by highlighting the dynamic and evolving nature of religious practices within diasporic communities. As Pakistani Americans continue to navigate their cultural and religious landscapes, they contribute to the rich tapestry of American religious life, embodying a spirit of unity in diversity. Further research in this area will enhance our understanding of how diverse religious and cultural identities can be preserved and adapted in an increasingly interconnected world.

References

Ajala, I. (2017). From Islamic dress and Islamic fashion to cool Islam: An exploration of Muslim youth hybrid identities in the West. *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Cultural Studies*, *12*(3). https://doi.org/10.18848/2327-008X/CGP/v12i03/1-11

Al Areqi, R. M. M. (2016). Rise of islamic literature between fact and fiction. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, *7*(4). https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0704.07

Al Areqi, R. M. M. (2018). Immigration Journey to Citizenship and Reconstruction of Refugees' Identity. *PUBLIC POLICY AND ADMINISTRATION REVIEW*, *6*(2). https://doi.org/10.15640/ppar.v6n2a4

Al Areqi, R. M. M. (2022). Search for Ancestral Roots in Morgan Jerkins's Wandering in Strange Lands. *World Journal of English Language*, *12*(1). https://doi.org/10.5430/wjel.v12n1p154

Al-Areqi, A. R., Yu, X., Yang, R., Wang, C., Wu, C., & Zhang, W. (2023). Synthesis of zinc ferrite particles with high saturation magnetization for magnetic induction hyperthermia. *Journal of Magnetism and Magnetic Materials*, *579*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmmm.2023.170839

Alex Lubin and Marwan M. Kraidy, editors. American Studies Encounters the Middle East. (2017). *The American Historical Review*, *122*(1). https://doi.org/10.1093/ahr/122.1.291b

Alexandra Pitacho, L., Palma, P., & Correia, P. (2019). Work orientation: Dimensionality and internal model. *Analise Psicologica*, *37*(4). https://doi.org/10.14417/ap.1667

Allen, K. R., Molloy, S., Sonnier-Netto, L., Naar, J., & Nelson, L. (2017). The Way We Never Were: American Families and the Nostalgia Trap . *Journal of Family Theory & Review*, *9*(3). https://doi.org/10.1111/jftr.12207

Almaneea, A. (2022). Numerical study on heat and mass transport enhancement in MHD Williamson fluid via hybrid nanoparticles. *Alexandria Engineering Journal*, *61*(10). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aej.2022.01.041

Amselle, J. L. (2010). De la déconstruction de l'ethnie au branchement des cultures: Un itinéraire intellectuel. *Actes de La Recherche En Sciences Sociales*, *185*. https://doi.org/10.3917/arss.185.0096

Ann Humes, C. (2010). Transcendent in America: Hindu Inspired Meditation Movements as New Religion. By Lola Williamson. *The Journal of Hindu Studies*, *3*(3). https://doi.org/10.1093/jhs/hiq021

Areqi, R. Al. (2017). Islamic Nations and Female Narrations. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, *22*(04). https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-2204073038

Areqi, R. M. M. Al, & Bahji, H. S. Al. (2014). Muslim and Mosque in Postcolonial Text. *English Language and Literature Studies*, *4*(1). https://doi.org/10.5539/ells.v4n1p54

ATİK, A.-. (2015). Dini Gelişim Kuramlarına Din Eğitimi Bağlamında Genel Bir Bakış. *İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi*, *4*(3). https://doi.org/10.15869/itobiad.94744

Bondi, L. (1992). Gender symbols and urban landscapes. *Progress in Human Geography*, *16*(2). https://doi.org/10.1177/030913259201600201

Bondi, L. (1999). Between the woof and the weft: a response to Loretta Lees. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, *17*(3). https://doi.org/10.1068/d1703fst

Bondi, L. (2014). Feeling insecure: a personal account in a psychoanalytic voice. *Social & Cultural Geography*, *15*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/14649365.2013.864783

Bonnet, D. (2003). Amselle, Jean-Loup. – Branchements. Anthropologie de l'universalité des cultures. *Cahiers d'études Africaines*, *43*(171). https://doi.org/10.4000/etudesafricaines.1528

Boyarin, D., & Burrus, V. (2005). Hybridity as subversion of orthodoxy? Jews and Christians in late antiquity. In *Social Compass* (Vol. 52, Issue 4). https://doi.org/10.1177/0037768605058148

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison. (2007). *Research Methods in Education - 6e | Louis Cohen, Lawrence Manion, Keith Morrison | digital library Bookfi*. http://en.bookfi.net/book/1403129

Creswell, J., & Poth, C. (2016). Second Edition QUALITATIVE INQUIRY& RESEARCH DESIGN Choosing Among Five Approaches. In *SAGE Publications* (Vol. 3).

Cupito, M. C. (2002). Diana Eck, A New Religious America: How a Christian Country Has Become the World's Most Religiously Diverse Nation. *Journal of Media and Religion*, *1*(1). https://doi.org/10.1207/s15328415jmr0101_8

Davidson, J., & Bondi, L. (2004). Spatialising affect; affecting space: An introduction. *Gender, Place and Culture*, *11*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/0966369042000258686

Dawar, A., Shah, Z., Tassaddiq, A., Kumam, P., Islam, S., & Khan, W. (2021). A convective flow of Williamson nanofluid through cone and wedge with non-isothermal and non-isosolutal conditions: A revised Buongiorno model. *Case Studies in Thermal Engineering*, *24*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.csite.2021.100869

de la Torre, G. B. (2021). Space, gender, knowledge. Feminist readingsedited. *Gender, Place & Culture*, *28*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/0966369x.2020.1750819

Dweik, S. C. M. (2022). Boycott eurovision singing to the song of its own tune: Global boycotts as sites of hybridity. *Journal of International and Intercultural Communication*, *15*(4). https://doi.org/10.1080/17513057.2022.2116080

Dyck, I. (2007). Emotional Geographies by Joyce Davidson, Liz Bondi, and Mick Smith, eds. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, *97*(2). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8306.2007.00549.x

Esack, F., Boomgaard, R., & Vincent-Lambert, C. (2023). Tension in Religious Practices of Muslim Students when Studying Emergency Medical Care. *Journal for the Study of Religion*, *35*(2). https://doi.org/10.17159/2413-3027/2022/v35n2a6

Harbord, J. (2006). Book Review: Hybridity, or the Cultural Logic of Globalization. *Global Media and Communication*, *2*(3). https://doi.org/10.1177/1742766506069583

Heise, T. (2014). Richard Price's Lower East Side: Cops, culture and gentrification. *Journal of Urban Cultural Studies*, *1*(2). https://doi.org/10.1386/jucs.1.2.235_1

Helbrecht, I. (2011). Emotion, Place and Culture - Edited by Mick Smith, Joyce Davidson, Laura Cameron and Liz Bondi. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, *35*(3). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2427.2011.01060_2.x

Hooks, B. (2014). Feminism Is for Everybody: Passionate Politics. In *Feminism Is for Everybody: Passionate Politics*. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315743189

Hyams, M. (2003). Subjectivities, Knowledges, and Feminist Geographies: The Subjects and Ethics of Social Research. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, *93*(4). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8306.2003.09304014_10.x

Jaffe, A., Werbner, P., & Modood, T. (1999). Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism. *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, *5*(1). https://doi.org/10.2307/2661026

Jones, A. W. (2022). Hybridity and Christian identity. *Missiology: An International Review*, *50*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/00918296211043533

Kraidy, M. M. (2002). Hybridity in cultural globalization. *Communication Theory*, *12*(3). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2885.2002.tb00272.x

Kraidy, M. M. (2009a). Hybridity, or the cultural logic of globalization. *Mass Communication Research*, *100*. https://doi.org/10.26530/oapen_626979

Kraidy, M. M. (2009b). My (Global) media studies. *Television and New Media*, *10*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/1527476408325101

Kukathas, C. (2001). Education and citizenship in diverse societies. In *International Journal of Educational Research* (Vol. 35, Issue 3). https://doi.org/10.1016/S0883-0355(01)00027-1

Leigh, G. K., & Coontz, S. (1994). The Way We Never Were: American Families and the Nostalgia Trap. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, *56*(1). https://doi.org/10.2307/352720

Lindisfarne, N., Menski, W., Lee, S.-P., & Werbner, P. (2002). Reproducing the Multicultural Nation: Responses to Pnina Werbner, AT 18(2). *Source: Anthropology Today*, *18*(4).

McDowell, L., & Sharp, J. (2016). Space, gender, knowledge: Feminist readings. In *Space, Gender, Knowledge: Feminist Readings*. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315824871

Mehta, A., & Bondi, L. (1999). Embodied discourse: on gender and fear of violence. *Gender, Place and Culture*, *6*(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/09663699925150

Miller, L. (2012). (Re)turning to Place: Spatialities, Belongings and Being in the World. *Journal for the Study of Religion, Nature & Culture*, *6*(1).

Mintz, S., & Coontz, S. (1993). The Way We Never Were: American Families and the Nostalgia Trap. *The American Historical Review*, *98*(5). https://doi.org/10.2307/2167203

Mitchell, C. (2006). The religious content of ethnic identities. *Sociology*, *40*(6). https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038506069854

Negrão, L. N. (2008). Trajetórias do sagrado. *Tempo Social*, *20*(2). https://doi.org/10.1590/s0103-20702008000200006

Nursten, J. (2013). Liz Bondi, David Carr, Chris Clark and Cecelia Clegg (eds), Towards professional wisdom . *Journal of Social Work*, *13*(2). https://doi.org/10.1177/1468017312457932

Philippon, A. (2021). Islam in Pakistan: A History, by Muhammad Qasim Zaman. *Comparative Islamic Studies*, *14*(1–2). https://doi.org/10.1558/cis.20056

Pieterse, J. N. (1994). Globalisation as hybridisation. *International Sociology*, *9*(2). https://doi.org/10.1177/026858094009002003

Reed, J. E. (2011). Review: Pakistan A Hard Country . *International Journal: Canada's Journal of Global Policy Analysis*, *66*(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/002070201106600406

Seligman, A. B., Kymlicka, W., & Norman, W. (2001). Citizenship in Diverse Societies. *Contemporary Sociology*, *30*(6). https://doi.org/10.2307/3089032

Spurles, P. L. K., & Werbner, P. (2006). Imagined Diasporas among Manchester Muslims. *Anthropologica*, *48*(2). https://doi.org/10.2307/25605320

Stewart, J. (2012). Pakistan: A Hard Country. *Asian Affairs*, *43*(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/03068374.2012.642558

Sumai, S., Naumi, A. T., & Toni, H. (2017). Dramaturgi Umat Beragama: Toleransi dan Reproduksi identitas Beragama di Rejang Lebong Dramaturgy of Religious People : Tolerance and Reproduction of Religious Identity in Rejang Lebong. *Kontekstualita: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Dan Keagamaan*, *33*(1).

Tabassum, N. (2021). Distortion of Cultural Anthropology in Haji's The Writing on My Forehead: A Feminist Analysis. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, *2*(III). https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2021(2-iii)17

Twine, F. W., Werbner, P., & Modood, T. (2000). Debating Cultural Hybridity: Multi-Cultural Identities and the Politics of Anti-Racism. *Contemporary Sociology*, *29*(1). https://doi.org/10.2307/2654960

Werbner, P. (1985). The organization of giving and ethnic elites: Voluntary associations amongst Manchester Pakistanis. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, *8*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.1985.9993492

Werbner, P. (1996). Fun Spaces: On Identity and Social Empowerment Among British Pakistanis. *Theory, Culture & Society*, *13*(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276496013004003

Werbner, P. (1997). Television, Ethnicity and Cultural Change. *American Ethnologist*, *24*(2). https://doi.org/10.1525/ae.1997.24.2.484

Werbner, P. (1998). Exoticising Citizenship: Anthropology And The New Citizenship Debate. *Canberra Anthropology*, *21*(2). https://doi.org/10.1080/03149099809508364

Werbner, P. (1999a). Arguing Sainthood: Modernity, Psychoanalysis, and Islam. *American Ethnologist*, *26*(4). https://doi.org/10.1525/ae.1999.26.4.1035

Werbner, P. (1999b). Global pathways. Working class cosmopolitans and the creation of transnational ethnic worlds*. *Social Anthropology*, *7*(1). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8676.1999.tb00176.x

Werbner, P. (1999c). Political Motherhood and the Feminisation of Citizenship: Women's Activism and the Transformation of the Public Sphere. In *Women, Citizenship and Difference*.

Werbner, P. (2000a). Book Review: Islam and Feminisms: An Iranian Case-Study. *Sociological Research Online*, *5*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/136078040000500101

Werbner, P. (2000b). Introduction: The Materiality of Diaspora—Between Aesthetic and "Real" Politics. *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies*, *9*(1). https://doi.org/10.3138/diaspora.9.1.5

Werbner, P. (2006). Vernacular Cosmopolitanism. *Theory, Culture & Society*, *23*(3). https://doi.org/10.1177/026327640602300291

Werbner, P. (2010). Religious identity. In *The SAGE Handbook of Identities*. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446200889.n13

Werbner, P. (2013). Everyday multiculturalism: Theorising the difference between "intersectionality" and "multiple identities." *Ethnicities*, *13*(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796813483728

Werbner, P. (2018). Between Islamic piety, agency and ethical leadership: paradoxes of self-transformation. *Contemporary Levant*, *3*(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/20581831.2018.1449934

Werbner, P. (2021). Introduction: The Dialectics of Cultural Hybridity. In *Debating Cultural Hybridity*. https://doi.org/10.5040/9781350219496.ch-001

Werbner, P. (2023). Between Tristes Tropiques and Cultural Creativity: In *Against Exoticism*. https://doi.org/10.2307/jj.7079934.5

Werbner, P., & Werbner, R. (2020). Adultery Redefined: Changing Decisions of Equity in Customary Law as "Living Law" in Botswana. *Political and Legal Anthropology Review*, *43*(1). https://doi.org/10.1111/plar.12344

Werbner, P., & Werbner, R. (2021). Divorce as process, Botswana style. In *African Customary Justice*. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003241881-9

Zaman, M. Q. (2018). Islam in Pakistan: A History. In *Islam in Pakistan: A History*. https://doi.org/10.1080/09584935.2019.1649062